# STH TT898 Theology and Trauma

Boston University School of Theology Spring 2012 10:00am-5:00pm – M-F January 5-13, 2012

Shelly Rambo Office: STH 331 E-mail: <u>srambo@bu.edu</u> Phone: (617) 358-1735 Michelle Walsh (T.A.) E-mail: walsh\_michelle@msn.com

The traumatic event challenges an ordinary person to become a theologian, a philosopher, and a jurist. The survivor is called upon to articulate the values and beliefs that she once held and that the trauma destroyed. She stands mute before the emptiness of evil, feeling the insufficiency of any known system of explanation. Survivors of atrocity of every age and every culture come to a point in their testimony where all questions are reduced to one, spoken more in bewilderment than in outrage: Why? The answer is beyond human understanding. Judith Herman, *Trauma and Recovery* 

### **REQUIRED TEXTS**

- Judith Herman. Trauma and Recovery
- James Poling. Rethinking Faith: A Constructive Practical Theology
- Grace Cho. Haunting the Korean Diaspora: Shame, Secrecy, and the Forgotten War
- Wendy Farley. Tragic Vision and Divine Compassion
- Nancy Pineda-Madrid. Suffering and Salvation in Cuidad Juárez
- Alex Kotlowitz. There Are No Children Here

Theology & Trauma [select one or another of your choosing]

- Serene Jones. Trauma and Grace: theology in a Ruptured World
- Shelly Rambo. Spirit and Trauma: A Theology of Remaining
- Flora Keshkgegian. Redeeming Memories: A Theology of Healing and Transformation

Trauma & Healing [select one]

- Annie Rogers. The Unsayable
- Peter Levine. Healing Trauma
- Richard Mollica. Healing Invisible Wounds: Paths to Hope and Recovery in a Violent World
- Cathy Caruth. Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, & History

### THE COURSE

This course brings recent studies in the interdisciplinary study of trauma to bear on the field of theology. It asks: What unique challenges does trauma pose to contemporary theology? The course aims to familiarize you with the field of trauma studies and to deepen your ability, as a theologian, to respond to the complex challenges confronting traumatized persons and communities.

The course is loosely divided into four parts. The first explores theoretical and clinical studies of trauma. The second ("The Human Condition"), third ("God"), and fourth ("Living On") parts focus on theological questions

posed in the face of trauma, suffering, and violence. Throughout the course, we continually press the questions: How does the phenomenon of trauma challenge and reshape the ways that theologians engage questions of suffering? What do theological understandings of the divine and human contribute to discussions of trauma? What challenges might particular contexts bring to religious leaders?

### COURSE GOALS

- To gain deeper understanding of the phenomenon of trauma from a variety of clinical and theoretical perspectives
- To provide a working vocabulary and theological lens for addressing situations of trauma
- To assist students in navigating pressing issues from multiple theological perspectives
- To provide students with the necessary skills and vocabulary to do effective and passionate crossdisciplinary work
- To provide students with resources and insights for developing constructive theological proposals

### INSTRUCTIONAL TEAM

Shelly Rambo is Assistant Professor of Theology at Boston University School of Theology. Her research focuses on rethinking classical themes in the Christian tradition in light of contemporary experiences of suffering, trauma, and violence. Through a series of faculty grants funded by Boston University's Center for Practical Theology, she designed workshops that offer religious leaders critical tools for thinking theologically about trauma. She is also partnering with faculty at Boston University's School of Social Work to research the religious implications of American military involvement and, specifically, the role that chaplains play in combat situations.

Rev. Michelle A. Walsh is an ordained Unitarian Universalist minister who is currently studying for a PhD in practical theology with a concentration in pastoral theology and psychology at Boston University. She also holds a master of divinity and a master in social work from Boston University and is a licensed independent clinical social worker. Rev. Walsh has worked for over 17 years in lay and professional urban ministry and social work and has directed two major mental health clinics. She currently has a private practice in pastoral psychotherapy and urban consulting. Rev. Walsh's research interests are in the pastoral and public dimensions of trauma and theology, particularly in the urban context. She has done pilot studies on African-American youth rituals in the aftermath of violence and loss.

# COURSE FORMAT

Each day is divided into two segments. The morning session will run from 10am-1pm, and the afternoon session will run from 2-5pm. Each session will engage a new topic. I will provide the necessary background material for the given topic and then we will engage in both large and small group discussions of key issues in the study of trauma and theology. Discussions will generate from the blogs posted prior to class.

### SUSTAINING PRACTICES

Given the topic, the readings and discussions in this course will impact you in ways that you may not anticipate. I encourage each member of the class to develop (or continue) a practice that sustains her/his mind, body, and spirit during the course of the semester. This may be a form of exercise, artistic expression, bodywork, or practice of prayer. Throughout the course, I will also be introducing students to forms of self-care, and I welcome students to share other practices that they find helpful. (Suggestions: singing in a choir, yoga, meditation, walking, breathwork, dance, painting). A good book to consult for practices of self-care in relationship to trauma is: Laura van Dernoot Lipsly and Connie Burk, *Trauma Stewardship: An Everyday Guide to Caring for Self While Caring for Others*.

### COURSE WEBSITE

To access the course website on Blackboard, go to <u>http://blackboard.bu.edu</u>. The course should be listed on the right. Click on the course number/name (IT898 Theology and Trauma). A copy of the syllabus, announcements, assignments, and other course documents will be available on the site.

# COURSE GRADES

Your final course grade will be based on the following scale:20%Preparation and Participation20%Blog postings20%Theological Analysis20%Hope Statement10%Final Paper/Project (includes abstract)30%

Your final course grade will be based on the following scale:

A (94-100) excellent in all respects (4.0) A- (90-93) good in all and excellent in most respects (3.7) B+ (87-89) good in all and excellent in a few respects (3.3) B (84-86) good in all respects (3.0) B- (81-83) acceptable in all and good in most respects (2.7) C+ (78-80) acceptable in all and good in a few respects (2.3) – fail for Th.D./Ph.D. courses C (75-77) acceptable in all respects (2.0) C- (72-74) minimally acceptable (1.7) - fail for MDiv/MTS core courses D+ (69-71) D (66-68) D- (63-65) F (below 63) (0)

Important due-dates:

January 13: Hope Statement January 20: Theological Analysis paper due January 20: Abstract of the final project March 9: Final project due

# POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

### LATE WORK AND INCOMPLETES

All work must be turned in on time. If blog postings are submitted *after* the assigned time, they will *not* be counted. If other papers are turned in after the assigned date, they will be marked down one-third a letter grade for each day they are not submitted. (For example: one day late - an 'A-' will be reduced to a 'B+') In extraneous circumstances, if an incomplete is granted, the student must work with the professor to meet the negotiated deadline for the assignment and he/she forfeits the right to written comments on the project. If you have outstanding circumstances that prevent you from completing the work by the assigned date, please consult with the professor.

### PAPER FORMATTING AND DOCUMENTATION

Make sure that all of your assignments are properly documented. The important thing is to be consistent in your documentation and make sure that you provide accurate page numbers in order for me to locate quotes.

For blog postings, list the author's last name and page number after the sentence in which the reference is included. [Ex. (Farley, 22)]. You do *not* need to include a works cited page.

For theology paper & the final, please follow the Turabian style formatting for these papers. Use *footnotes* (instead of endnotes). For your final project, you must include a bibliography/works cited page. This is not necessary for blog postings. The Turabian formatting guide can be accessed from the following website:

<u>http://www.lib.berkeley.edu/instruct/guides/chicago-turabianstyle.pdf</u>. Please consult it when reviewing your documentation. ALL PAPERS SHOULD BE: DOUBLE-SPACED WITH 12PT FONT AND 1 INCH MARGINS.

### PLAGIARISM

All written work in this course *must* be original to you. One of the goals of the class is to have you engage *primary* textual material. You may consult secondary sources, but please be careful when drawing from these works in your writings. If you consult outside texts, please cite these sources in the proper format. This pertains to all external sources (books, journals, lectures, sermons, web-sites). I am required by the School of Theology to report all suspected cases of plagiarism to the Academic Dean's Office for review.

In many cases, students do not *intend* to plagiarize. These examples are copied from the University of Albany website (<u>http://www.albany.edu/undergraduate\_bulletin/regulations.html#integrity</u>) and may provide a fuller understanding of what falls under the plagiarism umbrella.

EXAMPLES OF PLAGIARISM INCLUDE: failure to acknowledge the source(s) of even a few phrases, sentences, or paragraphs; failure to acknowledge a quotation or paraphrase of paragraph-length sections of a paper; failure to acknowledge the source(s) of a major idea or the source(s) for an ordering principle central to the paper's or project's structure; failure to acknowledge the source (quoted, paraphrased, or summarized) of major sections or passages in the paper or project; the unacknowledged use of several major ideas or extensive reliance on another person's data, evidence, or critical method; submitting as one's own work, work borrowed, stolen, or purchased from someone else.

#### LANGUAGE

This course seeks to be inclusive of people of all genders, races, cultures, abilities, and sexual orientations. Throughout the course, we will endeavor to embody the principles set out in the BU student handbook and in the Community Principles established by the STH Task Force. Please be mindful that, when writing papers, you should use terms like people, world, us, human being, humanity, etc. instead of the terms man, mankind, and men. Although it may sound repetitive, using the term 'God' instead of using male or female pronouns to reference the divine, is a recommended alternative to gender exclusive language. (i.e. God's decision to love the world involved God's gift of Godself to the world). There are all types of exclusions that have taken place in the history of Christian theology; as theologians in contemporary society and in a global context, we want to make sure that we don't perpetuate those exclusions. If you have questions about the policy, please feel free to consult with the professor.

### COURSE REQUIREMENTS

### PREPARATION AND PARTICIPATION (20%)

Attendance at each class session is required. A good classroom experience requires a collaborative effort and a student's absence detracts from the learning process of the whole. If you are unable to attend a session, please let me know in advance. Any more than **one** absence will result in a demarcation of your final grade (an 'A-' will be reduced to an 'B+'). Absence from class can occur in other forms as well. The expectation is that you will come to class prepared to discuss the assigned readings. Discussion involves speaking, active listening, and raising questions that will move the conversation towards deeper insights.

### **BLOG POSTINGS (20%)**

In preparation for each class, you will write a **one to two** paragraph response to the assigned readings. I encourage you to use these postings to respond to—and develop—an idea in the reading that impressed you, concerned you, or assisted you in deepening your understanding of trauma and theology. Please feel free to use the reading guide questions in the syllabus as springboards for your postings.

You must submit **5** responses. Responses must be posted each morning by **7am**. Postings receive after this time will *not* be counted. It is essential to respect this time-frame in order to give your colleagues enough time to read and respond to your comments.

The aim of the responses is: 1) to assist you in reading comprehension and synthesis of the material; 2) to develop your ability to identify and effectively articulate an author's key point; 3) to practice expressing your ideas in a concise manner. A longer response is *not* necessarily a better response. For the purposes of this exercise, you want to make your point quickly and clearly. Do *not* exceed two paragraphs.

#### Weekly Posting Example

#### Cat Dodson

This week, Kathryn commented on Moltmann and Jones' explorations of suffering and hope through Reformed Trinitarian theologies. Kathryn hints at a connection between the bodily imprint of trauma as we learned from van der Kolk last week, and the value of a decreased sense of isolation that can come from the reality of God as co-sufferer highlighted in these essays. In light of the vision of a God who embraces both the particular sufferer as well as the whole suffering world, I see potential for transformation (dare I say healing and reconciliation?) in the reality of the embodied experience of trauma and subsequent alienation of mind from body and the rest of the world. If we see the traumatized person as one who closes herself off in many ways from emotion and relationship, what happens when this alienated, wholly alone self is confronted with the Trinitarian reality of a God who holds the pain of loss and sin within the triune community of Godself? This is the move I see Serene Jones make in her vision of the woman wracked by grief and held by God, who opens up – hope for the future, hope borne out of real love in the midst of pain.

Are Moltmann and Jones asking for a suspension of our knowledge of God as triumphant in the resurrection? I don't think so. I see the basis of their hope in the taking up of human suffering into the being of God who holds both death and life within, who is at once both larger than this lived reality and particular enough to love those who suffer within it. So—my question is, is this enough? Is the reconciling action of God in history, and the hope that is the "ground for a love which is stronger than death and can sustain death…the ground for living and bearing guilt and sorrow for the future of man in God" (Moltmann, "The Crucified God" 278) enough for the one who suffers here and now, who cannot afford to take the eschatological long view?

The strength of this posting is three-fold: 1) she demonstrates that she is following the class conversation (connecting not only to the author but to other members of the class); 2) she demonstrates comprehension of the weekly readings; 3) she raises a couple of questions at the end that will be fruitful for class discussion.

#### THEOLOGICAL ANALYSIS PAPER (20%)

#### Due January 20

You have selected a text that provides a theological assessment of—and response to—trauma. The aim of this paper is to analyze the author's contributions to key questions surrounding trauma. Your essay should follow the structure of the course: 1) provide a very brief introduction of the book: noting context, genre, author's purpose for writing, intended audience ( $\sim 1/2$  page); 2) identify how the author defines trauma and her/his methodological approach to the study of trauma ( $\sim 1/2$  page); 3) describe and analyze the author's *theological* contribution. ( $\sim 2.5$  pages) A helpful way to approach this is to think about the author's response to one of the major questions of the course:

- who are human beings that we wound and can be so wounded?
- who/what/where is God in the suffering?
- who are we to be in the aftermath?

4) evaluate the implications, the limitations, the trajectories of their thought (~1.5 pages). This is where your own theological analysis comes in, as you challenge, affirm, or move forward what the author proposes. You may want to approach this by asking: What are your lingering questions? *or* In the author's answer to one of the above questions, how are the other questions impacted?

### HOPE STATEMENT (10%)

#### Due January 13

After a semester of studying trauma, it is important to reflect on hope in the aftermath of trauma. Is there hope, and, if so, what constitutes that hope? You will prepare a 180 second statement. It is not a definitive or binding statement but, instead, reflects where you are at that point in time. This may take written form, but it is not limited to this. On January 13, you will share this statement with the class, and it will be videotaped. You will have the option of whether you would like the video to appear on the 'Theology and Trauma' website.

#### 180 Second Hope Statements

Prompter Questions:

- When I think of hope, I think of ..... (an image, person, place)
- As a Christian/Buddhist/Moslem/Jew (name your affiliation), where does your hope lie?
- In the aftermath of trauma, hope tastes like/smells like/feels like/sounds like.....

#### FINAL PROJECT (30%)

#### Due March 9

Many of you took the course because you are working in particular contexts in which the themes of the course are timely and relevant. Your project should be designed with this context in mind. For example, you may be working in a chaplaincy position in a VA hospital, or you may be studying towards a career in religion and public policy. How would what you know about trauma and theology be best presented in this context?

The final project provides you with an opportunity to integrate the readings and discussions that we have been discussing throughout the semester. You will design a project that reflects your best contribution to the interdisciplinary discussion between religious studies/theology and trauma. You will design the project with a particular audience in mind. I encourage you to consider two things in conceiving the project: 1) the issues and questions that concern you most, and 2) the medium through which these issues are best conveyed. Here are some suggestions:

- a fictional piece that you submit to a journal
- a sermon that you plan to preach
- a ritual composed for a particular event
- an editorial that you submit to a magazine or newspaper
- study curriculum for a particular group
- a conference proposal and presentation
- a media piece.

On **January 20**, submit an abstract of your project. In this abstract, you will argue the importance of the project and the chosen medium. I will return it to you with comments in preparation for your final presentation and submission of the bibliography. The abstract must include the following components: 1) a brief description of your project, the key theological issues you are engaging (you may state this in the form of a question), an explanation of why this project is important, and the intended audience; 2) explanation of the medium; 3) a list of preliminary sources (at least 3 sources).

### TH.D./PH.D. ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS

To take this course at the doctoral level, you are expected to take on the following additional requirements:

### IN-CLASS PRESENTATION

On Friday, January 13, you will present to the class one theologian's perspective on the topic of forgiveness. This presentation is intended to broaden our perspective on forgiveness by linking us to an author who develops a theology of forgiveness. The presentation will be no more than 15 minutes. The content should be two-fold: 1) a presentation of the main ideas of the author; 2) bringing the author into conversation with the ideas we have

discussed in the course, i.e. How does this theologian's concept of forgiveness bear on one particular aspect of trauma? What are the demands that trauma put on her/his concept of forgiveness?

### FINAL PAPER OR PROJECT

Here are some *options* in lieu of the integrative project that will allow you to incorporate this course into your overall professional development.

- 1. Conference Paper: You will write a conference proposal and paper to be submitted to an upcoming conference in your professional area. You will need to submit the proposal by that date and turn in the paper at the end of the semester. The paper must be informed by the ideas discussed in the course. If you need help finding a conference, please consult with the professor.
- 2. Qualifying Examination: If you are planning to include a postmodern theology component to your qualifying examinations, you will construct an annotated bibliography of texts and take a 'test run' qualifying exam in the format that is required in your particular area.
- 3. Class lecture/presentation: You are asked to give a formal lecture on one of the authors or topics that we have discussed in the course. Prepare a 45 minute presentation that you would give in one of the following contexts: a) a free-standing seminary within your particular religious tradition; b) a university-based divinity school; c) a liberal arts college (either religiously or non-religiously affiliated).

# **BLOG POSTS**

Blog posts:

- 1. Go to BUWordPress. You will be asked for your BU username and Kerberos password.
- 2. Click on Class Blogs left tool bar. Click on appropriate session heading.
- 3. Click Add New. When you are finished, make sure you click "Publish."
- 4. Print out the posts to bring to class.
- 5. Andrew Tripp is assisting me in the design of the web-site. Questions about the logistics of posting should be directed to him at: <a href="mailto:astripp@bu.edu">astripp@bu.edu</a>.

# TIPS FOR READING UNFAMILIAR TEXTS

These questions should serve as a guide for reading each of the texts in the class. If you are unfamiliar with a text, it is helpful to begin with some "orienting" questions – the 'where am I?' questions. These will help you get your bearings (especially #1 and #2). Once you know a bit more about the author, audience, and vocabulary, you can begin to determine what matters to this author. (at the heart of #3 and #4) Then you get to see how they go about making their argument. The method and structure will also reflect #1 and #2.

- 1. What is the author's field? With whom is she/he already in conversation? What terms and vocabulary is she/he using? (note repetitions of words and concepts)
- 2. Who is her/his primary audience?
- 3. What are the central problems that he/she is addressing?
- 4. What does she/he want to get me to see or to do in response to reading?

5. How is she/he going to do that? What is her/his method? (begin with examining the chapter titles to get a sense of the structure and flow of the text. What clues do they provide?)

# - COURSE SCHEDULE -

#### THURSDAY, JANUARY 5

Session One: Introduction to the Course and to the Study of Trauma

- ✤ Major Reading:
  - Judith Herman, Trauma and Recovery
- Focus for the Herman reading: 1) What stands out to you in Herman's presentation of the *history* of the study of trauma?; 2) How does gender operate in the study of trauma?; 3) What distinguishes trauma from suffering?; 4) Herman identifies three components of trauma and three components of healing. Which component was most striking to you? As a *scholar of religion*, which component resonated the most with the discourse of religion, as you have studied it?

#### Session Two: The Clinical and the Theological: Approaching Healing

- ✤ Major Readings:
  - James Newton Poling. Rethinking Faith: A Constructive Practical Theology (Pt. 1)
  - John Thatamanil. Selections from *The Immanent Divine*, focus on pp. 16-18.
- Focus for the Poling reading: 1) This book provides an example of how one theologian works through the questions that we are dealing with in this course methodologically and informed by a particular movement of thought within theology, i.e. process thought. Poling's approach may not align with your own, but he provides *a* way of orienting ourselves to the major theological questions of the class:
  - who are human beings that we wound and can be so wounded?
  - who/what/where is God in the suffering?
  - who are we to be in the aftermath?

Track these questions in his text, asking, in particular: How does Poling understand the nature of God and God's relationship with the world? Given this, how do we make sense of trauma? What does healing look like?

Focus for the Thatamanil reading: What does a reading selection on comparative theology has to do with this course? Pay particular attention to pp. 16-18 and what he says about the medical model as a tool for comparative theology.

### FRIDAY, JANUARY 6

Session Three – Multiple Approaches to Trauma Healing; Historical Trauma

- Bringing insights to class from the book you read. (Annie Rogers, Peter Levine, Richard Mollica, Cathy Caruth)
- ✤ Major Readings:
  - o Grace Cho. Haunting the Korean Diaspora
  - Maria Root. "Reconstructing the Impact of Trauma on Personality," in *Personality and Psychopathology*, 229-265.
- Focus for your trauma book you selected: 1) How does your author *define* trauma? What assumptions underlie this definition? What does it reflect about their view of: a) human nature; b)

transcendence; c) meaning/purpose of life?; 2) Is trauma healing possible? If so, what does the process of healing look like? What are the necessary components to healing?

Focus for the Cho reading: 1) What theories of trauma inform Cho?; 2) From the perspective of the U.S., the Korean War is referred to as "the Forgotten War." Explore the function of "forgetting" and "remembering" in Cho's book.; 3) The historical and personal are woven together throughout the book, and she is tracing what she calls transgenerational trauma. Is trauma inherited?; 4) She identifies the book as a study of a ghostly figure. (27) How do ghosts, hauntings, and spirits function in the book? 5) What effect do the pictures have on you, as a reader? Why does Cho include them?

#### Session Four – Theological Interpretations

- Guest visit: Holly Benzenhafer-Redford, intoning practice
- ✤ Major Reading:
  - James Newton Poling. Rethinking Faith: A Constructive Practical Theology (pt. 2)
- Focus for the Poling reading: 1) How would Poling make sense of historical trauma, as described in Cho's book?; 2) Is Poling's theology contextually relevant? Can it speak meaningfully to the particular realities of the Korean situation?

#### MONDAY, JANUARY 9

Session Five: Human Nature – Sin, Guilt, & Shame

- ✤ Major Readings:
  - Selections from Augustine. *City of God.* (Book 14, chs. 11-19 in *Creation and Humanity*, pp. 204-214.)
  - Selections from Reinhold Niebuhr. The Nature and Destiny of Man (Vol. 1, 251-260 in Creation and Humanity, pp. 282-288.
  - James Gilligan. "Shame, Guilt, and Violence," *Social Research*, Winter 2003. http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi\_m2267/is\_4\_70/ai\_112943739
  - Richard Mollica "Humiliation," in Healing Invisible Wounds: Paths to Hope and Recovery in a Violent World, pp. 62-87.
- Focus for the readings: 1) Within the Christian tradition, the major diagnosis for what is wrong in the world is identified through the term 'sin.' Two influential interpreters of sin are Augustine and Reinhold Niebuhr. What is the picture of the human condition that they offer? What are the potential limitations of this diagnosis?; 2) The Gilligan and Mollica pieces identify shame as one of the central issues at the heart of trauma. Guilt, not shame, has been at the heart of theological diagnoses of sin. How do the authors distinguish between shame and guilt? How do you? How might a serious consideration of shame/humiliation impact our understanding of sin?
- For Future Reading: James Gilligan, selections from Violence: A National Epidemic; Judith Herman, "Shattered Shames"; Helen Block Lewis, ch. 1 in The Role of Shame in Symptom Formation

Session Six: Human Nature – Interpreting Suffering From Different Religious Traditions

Afternoon workshop with Hari Kirin Khalsa, http://www.artandyoga.com/hari-kirin/biography/

### TUESDAY, JANUARY 10

[Note time-change: noon-7pm – afternoon session & 5pm lecture at Mary Baker Eddy library]

Session Seven: Nature of God & God's Relationship with the World - pt. 1

- ✤ Major Readings:
  - Catherine Keller, "After Omnipotence: Power as Process" in On the Mystery, pp. 69-90.
  - Sallie McFague, "Is God in Charge?" in *Essentials in Christian Theology*, pp. 101-116.

- Barbara Brown Taylor, "The Will of God," ch. 20 in *Teaching Sermons on Suffering*, pp. 115-119.
- Elie Wiesel, "The Solitude of God," *Walking with God in a Fragile World*.
- ✤ Background Reading:
  - John Calvin. Selections from Institutes
  - Daniel Migliore, "The Providence of God and the Mystery of Evil," ch. 6 in *Faith Seeking* Understanding, pp. 99-119.
- Focus for the readings: In each of these readings, you are looking for how the author interprets divine *nature* and *presence*. How is God related to the world? Is God involved in the world process? If so, in what way? Sallie McFague's chapter heading, "Is God in Charge?," is a good question to trace through each of the writings; how would each author respond?

#### Session Eight: Nature of God & God's Relationship with the World - pt. 2

- ✤ Major Readings:
  - Wendy Farley. Tragic Vision & Divine Compassion
  - Wendy Farley, "Evil, Violence, and the Practice of Theodicy," in *Telling the Truth: Preaching about Sexual and Domestic Violence*, pp. 11-20.
- Focus for the Farley readings: One of the reasons that we are reading Farley is because she is a theologian who takes radical suffering as a starting point for her theology. 1) What is the normative vision to which Farley is responding? What is the problem of collapsing suffering under descriptions of sin? (preface); 2) Beginning on p. 53, she distinguishes radical suffering from suffering and argues the insufficiency of traditional theodicies. Note the distinction. How does this square with our earlier discussions of trauma? 3) A reinterpretation of divine power is central to Farley's work. What is her critique? Is God powerful in Farley's interpretation? Given our readings in Poling and Keller, how does this align with a process interpretation of God? (ch. 3); 4) How is God related to the world? (ch.4); 5) How does compassion operate? How does it respond to radical suffering?; 6) While readings the book, you want to ask: Why does Farley find a *tragic* vision more adequate for responding to radical suffering? Do you agree with her assessment? Is a tragic vision compelling?

### WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 11

#### Session Nine: Divine Suffering

- ✤ Major Readings:
  - Anselm of Canterbury, "The Logic of Atonement," in Readings in Christian Theology, pp. 210-217.
  - Jürgen Moltmann, selections from *The Crucified God*; "The Crucified God: Yesterday and Today," ch. 8 in *Cross Examinations*.
  - Watch presentation, "Strange Fruit: The Cross and the Lynching Tree," Ingersoll lecture, <u>http://www.hds.harvard.edu/multimedia/video/strange-fruit-the-cross-and-the-lynching-tree</u>

(Choose one author from the list below – reading selections are posted in Course Documents)

- Rita Nakashima Brock
- L. Serene Jones. "Hope Deferred: Theological Reflections on Reproductive Loss," *Modern Theology*, 17 no. 2 (April 2001), pp. 227-245.
- Susan L. Nelson
- Andrew Sung Park
- Mark I. Wallace
- Delores Williams.
- Background Reading: For a good summary of atonement theologies, read Darby Ray's, "Introduction," in *Deceiving the Devil: Atonement, Abuse, and Ransom,* pp. 1-18.

#### **\*** Focus for readings:

- **Anselm:** What is the central imagery for atonement in Anselm? How is atonement enacted?
- **Moltmann:** Moltmann writes, "The death of Jesus on the cross is the *centre* of all Christian theology." Why do you agree or not agree with this statement? Assess the critiques of Moltmann provided by either Dorothee Soelle or Karl Rahner. What are the strength and weakness of these objections?
- **Cone:** What is revealed on the cross? What transformation takes place? How?
- Jones: She reinterprets Moltmann using the imagery of reproductive loss. What is taking place on the cross?
- Nelson: She identifies the cross as a multivalent symbol. Why is this important?
- Park: In what way does his picture of the Trinity address the suffering of victims?
- Wallace: What is the role of the Spirit in redemption?
- Williams: Is the cross redemptive? Why/why not?

#### Session Ten: Salvation and Social Suffering

- \* Major Reading: Nancy Pineda-Madrid. Suffering and Salvation in Ciudad Juarez
- ✤ Guest Visit: Nancy Pineda-Madrid
- Focus for the Pineda-Madrid reading: 1) Pineda-Madrid says that a "social-suffering hermeneutic" offers an angle of vision on suffering. Describe that angle. (ch.1); 2) What stands out to you about situation in Ciudad Juárez, as Pineda-Madrid describes it?; What does she mean by the "making of evil"?; 3) Read pp. 58-68 closely. How does she link feminicide to the doctrine of salvation?; 4) Track her reading of Anselm and the historical legacy of his theology of the cross. Is his vision of salvation sufficient to address the situation of feminicide that Pineda-Madrid presents?; 5) How are practices of resistance connected to salvation? (ch.4); Where is salvation located? How does she address the issue of redemptive suffering? (ch.5); Given our earlier discussions about the nature of God, pay attention to her presentation of the divine nature that she offers at the end of the book, pp. 147-152.

### THURSDAY, JANUARY 12

Session Eleven: Spirit and Community: Case Study: urban trauma

- \* Major Reading: Alex Kotlowitz, There are No Children Here
- ✤ Leader: Michelle Walsh
- ◆ Focus for the Kotlowitz reading: 1) Drawing from your clinical readings on trauma theory, track the different manifestation of trauma symptoms for Lafavette and Pharoah as well as the different sources of their resilience; 2) Religion and the church play a very minimal role in their story yet they are present - in what ways and with what implications in terms of messaging or expressions about God and human nature (see chapters 5 and 21 for examples)?; 3) Where did you personally experience God and salvation in their story, if you did?; 4) Drawing on our earlier discussion of the Pineda-Madrid text, were there "practices of resistance" in evidence and does her "socialsuffering hermeneutic" seem to apply?; 5) Looking toward tomorrow's discussion on "forgiveness," Kotlowitz describes Lafayette as an "unforgiving child" (p. 55). Do you agree with Kotlowitz' assessment and does that play a role in Lafayette's ability "to heal" from his trauma vs. Pharoah's ability?; 6) Do any of the theories we've covered help you with understanding and theologically interpreting the complex mix of good and evil in the person of Jimmy Lee and the community's response to him (see chapter four)?; 7) Kotlowitz only describes his interactive role with the family in a brief note on reporting methods at the end, but what might the be the larger implications of his role in their story, integrating both your clinical readings and theological analysis (including implications related to race, class, and gender)?; 8) are there missing parts to this story, a larger historical narrative that might be needed to adequately situate the struggles of the Rivers family (e.g. think of in class discussions of historical trauma and theology)?

#### Session Twelve: Pastoral Psychology, Psychoanalysis & Trauma

- ✤ Major Readings:
  - Phillis Sheppard, chs. 1, 2, 4, and pp. 103-110 in Self, Culture, and Others in Womanist Practical Theology
  - M. Shawn Copeland, "Wading Through Many Sorrows," in *Troubling in my Soul*, pp. 109-129.
  - Emilie Townes, "Everydayness: Beginning Notes on Dismantling the Cultural Production of Evil," in *Womanist Ethics and the Cultural Production of Evil*, pp. 159-165.
- ✤ Guest visit: Phillis Sheppard
- Focus for the Sheppard readings: 1) Refer back to Herman's discussion of the origins of trauma in psychoanalysis. Sheppard. Why is it important for Sheppard to bring together psychoanalysis and black experience?; 2) Sheppard particularly highlights M. Shawn Copeland's definition of suffering. Why?; 3) Think back to earlier discussions of sin. How does sin fit into Copeland's description of suffering and resistance: 4) Sheppard presents a series of vignettes in which race, religion & gender intersect in ways that critically shape self-understanding. How, if at all, does this connect to our understanding of trauma? At what points in the stories can you detect the impact of what she calls "overlapping oppressions"?; 5) In conversation with Townes, reflect on the concept of trauma as a cultural produced.

### FRIDAY, JANUARY 13

Session Thirteen: Healing & Forgiveness

- ✤ Major Readings:
  - Desmond Tutu, short selection from No Future Without Forgiveness
  - Miroslav Volf, "Letting Go: The Final Miracle of Forgiveness" *Christian Century*, Dec. 12, 2006, pp. 28-31.
- View Michael Lapsley's address at the *Journey Towards Healing* conference, Belfast, Northern Ireland, March 10, 2011, pts. 1&2, <u>http://vimeo.com/23677961</u>, <u>http://vimeo.com/23682589</u>
- Watch short selections from Helen Whitney's PBS documentary, Forgiveness: A Time to Love and A Time to Hate: http://video.pbs.org/video/1855847795
  - Prologue
  - Atonement (Kathy & Claire)
  - Confronting Evil (Rwanda)
  - Intimate Woundings (Liesbeth & Dan)
  - Language of Anger (Terri Jentz)
- Focus for the Tutu and Volf readings: What theological assumptions underlie the author's views about forgiveness? What is the relationship between memory, forgetting, and healing that each author presents?
- Focus for Viewing: What issues does this situation raise for our class?

### Session Fourteen: Hope

- ✤ Assignment: presenting hope statements
- ✤ Reading:
  - Kaethe Weingarten. "Witnessing, Wonder, and Hope." *Family Process.* Vol. 39 Issue 4, May 2004, pp. 389-402.
  - View Kaethe Weingarten's address at the *Journey Towards Healing* conference, Belfast, Northern Ireland, March 10, 2011, pts. 1&2, <u>http://vimeo.com/23642518</u>, <u>http://vimeo.com/23674300</u>

### **TRAUMA RESOURCES**

- 1. David Baldwin's Trauma Information Pages: www.trauma-pages.com
- 2. Sidran Institute: Traumatic Stress Education and Advocacy: http://www.sidran.org/index.cfm
- 3. The Witnessing Project: www.witnessingproject.org
- 4. The Trauma Center: <u>www.traumacenter.org</u>
- 5. The International Society for Traumatic Stress Studies: <u>http://www.istss.org/what/index.cfm</u> (For resources, membership (student membership \$90), and conference presentation opportunities).
- 6. STAR program (Strategies for Trauma Awareness and Resilience). Sponsored by Eastern Mennonite University and Church World Service. Information on training programs for religious leaders working with traumatized communities. <u>http://www.emu.edu/ctp/star/</u>
- 7. Child Witness to Violence Program at the Boston Medical Center, <u>http://www.childwitnesstoviolence.org/contact.html</u>
- 8. Dave Emerson's yoga studio in Cambridge: http://www.blacklotusyogaproject.org/
- 9. Kundalini Yoga Studio & Art Gallery, Hari Kirin Kaur Khalsa, www.artandyoga.com
- 10. Military Trauma Healing Projects: *Theater of War*, <u>http://www.philoctetesproject.org/about.html</u>, Combat Paper Project, <u>http://www.combatpaper.org/video.html</u>

# — A D D I T I O N A L R E A D I N G S —

#### THURSDAY, JANUARY 5

Session One: Introduction to the Course and to the Study of Trauma

- ✤ Additional Readings
  - o Susan Brison. Aftermath: Violence and the Remaking of a Self.
  - Arieh Y. Shalev, "Treating Survivors in the Acute Aftermath of Traumatic Events," excerpt from *Treating Trauma Survivors with PTSD: Bridging the Gap Between Intervention Research and Practice.*
  - Bessel van der Kolk and Alexander C. McFarlane, "Trauma and Its Challenge to Society," chapter 3, *Traumatic Stress: The Effects of Overwhelming Experience on Mind, Body, and Society.*
  - Bessel van der Kolk. "Clinical Implications of Neuroscience Research in PTSD," Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences, pp. 1-17.
  - o Bessel van der Kolk articles. You can download these articles from:
    - http://www.traumacenter.org/products/publications.php
    - van der Kolk, Bessel. (1994) "The Body Keeps the Score: Memory and the Emerging Psychobiology of Post-Traumatic Stress." *Harvard Review of Psychiatry*, 1, pp. 253-265.
    - van der Kolk, Bessel. (2002). In Terror's Grip: Healing the Ravages of Trauma. *Cerebrum, 4,* pp. 34-50. NY: The Dana Foundation.
    - Insidious trauma: <u>http://www.medicalnewstoday.com/releases/237856.php</u>

Session Two: The Clinical and the Theological: Approaching Healing

- ✤ Additional Readings:
  - o Trauma Stewardship: An Everyday Guide to Caring for Self While Caring for Others
  - The Little Book of Trauma and Healing

### FRIDAY, JANUARY 6

Session Three – Multiple Approaches to Trauma Healing; Historical Trauma

✤ Additional Readings:

- o Kali Tal, chapter one in Worlds of Hurt: Reading the Literatures of Trauma
- Maurice Blanchot, "The Instant of My Death," (L'instant de ma mort)
- Dori Laub, "Bearing Witness or the Vicissitudes of Listening," and "An Event Without a Witness," in *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis, and History*
- Cathy Caruth, "Introduction," Critical Encounters: Reference and Responsibility in Deconstructive Writing, pp. 1-8.
- Graef, Liska, and Vloeberghs, eds. "Introduction: The Instance of Trauma," *European Journal of English Studies,* Vol. 7, No. 3, 2003, pp. 247-255.
- Geoffrey Hartman, "On Traumatic Knowledge and Literary Studies," New Literary History, 26:3 (1995), 537-563.
- Babette Rothschild. The Body Remembers. [Focus on Part One (pp. 1-73) and skim chapter
  6]
- Ethan Watters, "The Wave That Brought PTSD to Sri Lanka," ch. 2 in Crazy Like Us: The Globalization of the American Psyche, pp. 65-125.

#### Session Four – Theological Interpretations

- Additional Readings:
  - o Rowan Williams, selections from Writing in the Dust: After September 11
  - Rebecca Chopp, "Theology and the Poetics of Testimony," in *Converging on Culture*, pp. 56-70.
  - Fyodor Dostoevsky, "The Grand Inquisitor," *The Brothers Karamazov*. <u>http://www.mtholyoke.edu/acad/intrel/pol116/grand.htm</u>

#### MONDAY, JANUARY 9

Session Five: Human Nature – Sin, Guilt, & Shame

- ✤ Additional Readings:
  - James Gilligan, Part II, "The Germ Theory of Violence," in *Violence: Reflections on a National Epidemic*, 89-136.

0

Session Six: Human Nature – Interpreting Suffering From Different Religious Traditions

- ✤ Afternoon workshop with Hari Kirin Khalsa
- ✤ Additional Readings:

#### TUESDAY, JANUARY 10

[Note time-change: noon-7pm – afternoon session & 5pm lecture at Mary Baker Eddy library]

Session Seven: Nature of God & God's Relationship with the World – pt. 1

- ✤ Additional Readings
  - o Ivone Gebara. Out of the Depths: Women's Experience of Evil & Salvation

Session Eight: Nature of God & God's Relationship with the World – pt. 2

- ✤ Additional Readings:
  - Kate Braestrup interview with Krista Tippet, Speaking of Faith. Listen to: http://speakingoffaith.publicradio.org/programs/braestrup/kristasjournal20080626.shtml

#### WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 11

Session Nine: Divine Suffering

- ✤ Additional Readings:
  - Mark Lewis Taylor, "American Torture and the Body of Christ," in ch. 19 in *Cross/Examinations*, pp. 264-277.
  - Mark Lewis Taylor, "The Way of the Cross in Lockdown America," inaugural address, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1999.
  - o Mark Taylor. The Executed God: The Way of the Cross in Lockdown America
  - S. Mark Heim, "Saved by What Shouldn't Happen: The Anti-Sacrificial Meaning of the Cross," ch.14 in *Cross/Examinations*, pp. 211-224.
  - Melissa Raphael, "Feminist Intimations of the Holy in Auschwitz" and "The Redemption of God in Auschwitz," chs. 3 & 6 in *The Female Face of God in Auschwitz*, pp. 59-85, 128-165.
  - Britta Frede-Wenger, "Good' Friday after Auschwitz?," chapter 6 in *Fire in the Ashes: God, Evil, and the Holocaust,* pp. 137-148.

Session Ten: Salvation and Social Suffering

✤ Additional Readings:

Thursday, January 12: Thinking Contextually & Pastorally about Trauma

Session Eleven: Spirit and Community: Case Study: urban trauma

- ✤ Additional Readings:
  - o Geoffrey Canada. Stick, Fist, Knife, Gun
  - o Cristina Rathbone. A World Apart

Session Twelve: Pastoral Psychology, Psychoanalysis & Trauma

Additional Readings

#### Friday, January 13

Session Thirteen: Healing & Forgiveness

- ✤ Additional Readings:
  - o Judith Lewis Herman, "Justice From the Victim's Perspective," in *Violence Against Women*, Vol. 11, No. 5, May 2005, pp. 571-602.
  - Karen A. Armstrong, "Faith After September 11," Harvard Memorial Chapel, <u>http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/shows/faith/neighbors/armstrong.html</u>
  - Daniel P. McAdams. "When Redemption Fails," ch. 9 in *The Redemptive Self: Stories Americans Live By*, pp. 241-270.
  - Miroslav Volf articles:
    - "Redeeming the Past," Christian Century, February 13-20, 2002, p. 44
    - <sup>4</sup> "Letting Go: The Final Miracle of Forgiveness" *Christian Century*, Dec. 12, 2006, pp. 28-31.

#### Session Fourteen: Hope

- ✤ Additional Readings:
  - o Serene Jones, "Mourning and Wonder," ch. 9 in Trauma and Grace, pp. 152-165.
  - Cornel West, "Love and Service," and "Afterword," in *Hope on a Tightrope*, pp. 151-163, 216-17.

#### **RECOMMENDED BOOKS**

- 1. Jessica Stern. Denial: A Memoir of Terror
- 2. Annie Rogers. The Unsayable: The Hidden Language of Trauma
- 3. Peter Levine. Waking the Tiger: Healing Trauma and Healing Trauma
- 4. Kaethe Weingarten. Common Shock: Witnessing Violence Everyday
- 5. Marion Solomon and Daniel Siegel, eds. Healing Trauma: Attachment, Mind, Body, and Brain
- 6. Daniel Siegel, The Developing Mind: How Relationships and the Brain Interact to Shape Who We Are and Parenting from the Inside-Out
- 7. Bessel van der Kolk, Alexander McFarlane, and Lars Weisaeth, eds. Traumatic Stress
- 8. Flora Keshgegian. Redeeming Memories: A Theology of Healing and Transformation and Time for Hope
- 9. Richard Mollica. Healing Invisible Wounds: Paths to Hope and Recovery in a Violent World
- 10. Jennifer Beste. God and the Victim.
- 11. Emilie Townes. Womanist Ethics and the Cultural Production of Evil
- 12. Kathleen M. Sands. Escape from Paradise: Evil and Tragedy in Feminist Theology
- 13. William T. Cavanaugh. Torture and Eucharist: Theology, Politics, and the Body of Christ
- 14. Alan Lewis. Between Cross and Resurrection: A Theology of Holy Saturday
- 15. Susan Neiman. Evil in Modern Thought: An Alternative History of Philosophy.
- 16. Veena Das, Arthur Kleinman, and Mamphela Ramphele. Violence and Subjectivity
- 17. Paul Farmer. Pathologies of Power: Health, Human Rights, and the New War on the Poor.
- 18. Ann Cvetkovich. An Archive of Feelings: Trauma, Sexuality, and Lesbian Public Cultures
- 19. Terry Tempest Williams. Finding Beauty in a Broken World
- 20. "Faith Facing Trauma," issue of Review and Expositor, Vol. 105, No. 2, Spring 2008.
- 21. David Burrell. Deconstructing Theodicy: Why Job Has Nothing to Say to the Puzzle of Suffering.
- 22. David Finkel. The Good Soldiers

#### **RECOMMENDED MOVIES**

- 1. Urban Trauma: Crash, Waiting for Superman; The Lottery (2010)
- 2. Theodicy: God on Trial, Lucky
- 3. Trauma Theory: Hiroshima Mon Amour, Shoah, Memento
- 4. Redemption: Dead Man Walking, The Road, Loving Annabelle
- 5. War: The Thin Red Line, The Hurt Locker, In the Valley of Elah, Grbvica